

THE INFLUENCE OF THE *VyAKHyAyukti* CHAPTER 2 ON THE LATER BUDDHIST TREATISES

HORIUCHI, Toshio
JAPONYA/JAPAN/ЯПОНИЯ

ABSTRACT

The *VyAkhyAyukti* (abbr. to VyY) is a text written by a famous Buddhist monk Vasubandhu (ca. 400-480) which deals with the method of Buddhist exegeses. In the Chap. 2 of the VyY, Vasubandhu interprets the passages from 103 *sUtrakhaNDas* or passages of the canon. And what is noteworthy is that some of Vasubandhu's interpretations of the *sUtrakhaNDas* are cited by the later Buddhist treatises.

This paper points out that some of the passages of the VyY Chap. 2 were later cited in the *MahAvyutpatti* (Mvy), Yazomitra's *AbhidharmakozavyAkhyA*, and GuNaprabha's *BodhisattvabhUmivRtti*. It will also be reported that the **BuddhanusmRtiTika* attributed to Vasubandhu has long passages which exactly correspond to those found in the VyY Chap. 2 in their interpretation of the 'ten names of the Buddha'. This will confirm the influence of the VyY on the later Buddhist tradition.

VyAkhyAyukti, *MahAvyutpatti*, *AbhidharmakozavyAkhyA*, Vasubandhu

Key Words: Buddha, Buddhist.

1. Introduction

The *VyAkhyAyukti* (abbr. to VyY) is a text written by a famous Buddhist monk Vasubandhu (ca. 400-480) which deals with the method of Buddhist exegeses. Recent studies have made it clear that the VyY has a great influence on the later Buddhist treatises. This is especially the case with both the fivefold method of the exegesis discussed in Chap. 1 and the arguments for the authenticity of the *MahAyAnasUtra* as the teachings of the Buddha found in Chap. 4 of the VyY. Therefore, these two topics have often been taken up by contemporary scholars¹.

¹Shoenig, Jeffery D. (1992) "SUtra Commentaries in Tibetan Translation", Cabezon, José Ignacio ed., Buddhism, sexuality, and gender, State University of New York Press, Albany, New York, 111-124.

Skilling, Peter (2000) "Vasubandhu and the VyAkhyAyukti Literature", Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, 23-2, 297-350.

Verhagen, Peter (2005) "Studies in Indo-Tibetan Buddhist Hermeneutics (4): The VyAkhyAyukti by Vasubandhu", Journal Asiatique, 293.2, 559-602.

On the other hand, little have been done about the VyY Chap. 2. In this chapter of the VyY, Vasubandhu interprets the passages from 103 *sUtrakhaNDas* or passages of the canon. However, this chapter is important because it reveals Vasubandhu's development of thought through his interpretation of the Buddhist Canon. Further, since GuNamati's commentary on the VyY Chap. 2 quotes the detailed contents from these *sUtrakhaNDas* cited in the VyY, the comparative study of this chapter will bring us an important information concerning the *Agamas* or scriptures passed down to both Vasubandhu and GuNamati. Also noteworthy is that some of Vasubandhu's interpretations of the *sUtrakhaNDas* are cited by the later Buddhist treatises.

This paper points out that some of the passages of the VyY Chap. 2 were later cited in the *MahAvyutpatti* (Mvy), Yazomitra's *AbhidharmakozavyAkhyA*, and GuNaprabha's *BodhisattvabhUmivRtti*. It will also be reported that the **BuddhAnusmRtiTika* attributed to Vasubandhu has long passages which exactly correspond to those found in the VyY Chap. 2 in their interpretation of the 'ten names of the Buddha'. This will confirm the influence of the VyY on the later Buddhist tradition.

In relation to the above discussion, the present paper gives some emendations of the text of the corresponding passages of the VyY Chap. 2.

2. The *VyAkhyAyukti-sUtrakhaNDazata* and the *MahAvyutpatti*

The *VyAkhyAyukti-sUtrakhaNDazata* is a text which collected 103 (according to Lee's text) *sUtrakhaNDas* or passages of the canon (*Agama/nikAya*) of which passages are glossed in detail in the VyY Chap. 2². In this section, I shall firstly argue that the *MahAvyutpatti* (Mvy) gathered some vocabulary from the *VyAkhyAyukti-sUtrakhaNDazata* by pointing out that some passages of the Mvy correspond well to those of the VyY³.

²The *sUtrakhaNDas* cited in the VyY chapter 2 are fragmentally and one must consult the *VyAkhyAyukti-sUtrakhaNDazata* to know the detail of those *sUtras*. GuNamati's VyYT, on the other hand, cites those *sUtras* in more detail way and is important to know information about the *sUtras* transmitted in those days.

³Some of the recent studies which dealt with the sources of the Mvy are as follows (they are mostly concerned with the relationship between the Mvy and the Vinaya texts):

Eimer, Helmut (1985) "Chapter CCLXX of the MahAvyutpatti in Comparison with the PravrajyAvastu", Berliner Indologische Studien 1, S. 41-46.

do. (1989) "Das Kapitel CCLXX der MahAvyutpatti im Vergleich zum PravrajyAvastu", Dr. B. M. Baura Birth Centenary Commemoration Volume. Calcutta. S.149-153.

Nakagawa, Masanori (1993) "Vinayasūtra to Mahāvyutpatti (Vinayasūtra and Mahāvyutpatti" Watanabe Humimaro Hakase Tuitō Kinen RonsyU: Gensibukkyō to Daijyōbukkyō jyō, 355-372 (L).

Hinüber, Haiyan Hu-Von (1997) "On the Sources of Some Entries in the MahAvyutpatti-Contributions to Indo-Tibetan Lexicography I-" Untersuchungen zur buddhistischen Literatur Zweite Folge, Göttingen.

Schaub, Cristina Scherrer (2002) Enacting Words: A Diplomatic Analysis of the Imperial Decrees (Bkas Bcad) and their Application in the Sgra Sbyor Bam Po Gnyis pa Tradition, Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, 25.1-2, 263-340.

And secondly, by searching these sources and consulting its contexts, I want to clarify the meaning of some passages of the Mvy⁴.

VyY, 1⁵=Mvy, 2-11

This *sUtra* enumerates the so called “ten names of the Buddha” which begins with *tathAgata* and ends with *buddhaH bhagavAn*. The order of this in the VyY and the Mvy is different. The Mvy begins this with *buddhaH bhagavAn*, but these items are located at the end in the VyY. One of the sources of these ten names of the Buddha is MN, 91(MA, 161). See also section 4 of this paper.

VyY, 5=Mvy, 1291-1297

VyY:

(A) bcom ldan ‘das kyi chos ni legs par gsungs pa/ (B) yang dag par mthong ba/ (C) nad med pa/ (D) dus chad pa med pa/ (E) nye bar gtod pa/ (F) ‘di mthong ba la don yod pa/ (G) mkhas pa rnams kyis rang gis rig par bya’o

Mvy, 1291-1297:

(A)⁶ *svAkhyaTo bhagavato dharmaH*, bcom ldan ‘das kyi chos ni legs par gsungs pa (B) *sAMdRSTikaH*, yang dag par mthong ba (C) *nirjvaraH*, nad med pa (D) *AkAlikaH*, dus chad pa med pa (E) *aupanAyikaH*, nye bar gtod pa (F) *aihipaZyikaH*, ‘di mthong ba la don⁷ yod pa (G) *pratyAtmavedanIyo vijJaiH*, mkhas pa rnams kyis rang gis rig par bya ba

On the sources of this phrase, see CPD, II.679: *ehipassika*. One of them is:

SN, V.343.6-8:

(A) *svAkhAto bhagavatA dhammo* (B) *sandiTThiko* (C) *akAliko* (D) *ehipassiko* (E) *opanayiko* (F) *paccattam* (em. *paccattam*) (G) *veditabbo viJJUhIti* (em. *viJJAhIti*).

VyY, 6 =Mvy, 1298-1302

VyY:

⁴ The numbers of the Mvy are based on Sakaki’s edition because this is used frequently. But Ishihama and Fukuda’s new edition is far more reliable and when Sakaki’s edition has some problem, I refer to this text as Mvy(N).

⁵In this paper, “VyY, 1” means that this is the 1 st sUtra in the VyY Chap. 2 according to Lee’s edition of the VyY (section 2.4.3, pp.33-162). Texts are also based on Lee’s edition.

⁶ Here, (A) means that this is no.291 of the Mvy.

⁷According to Mvy (N), 1300, D(erje) and C(one) edition of the Mvy have this ‘don’. This is the same as the VyY.

(A) bcom ldan ‘das kyis legs par gsungs pa’i chos ‘dul ba ni legs par bstan pa/ (B) nges par ‘byung ba rdzogs pa’i byang chub tu ‘gro bar byed pa/ (C) mi mthun pa med cing ‘dus pa dang ldan pa zhes bya/ (D) brten pa yod pa zhes bya/ (E) ‘di ston pa de bzhin gshegs pa dgra bcom pa yang dag par rdzogs pa’i sangs rgyas so

Mvy, 1298-1302:

(A) *svAkhyAto bhagavato dharmavinayaH supraveditaH*, bcom ldan ‘das kyis legs par gsungs pa’i chos ‘dul ba ni legs par bstan pa (B) *nairyANikaH saMbodhigAmI*, nges par ‘byung ba rdzogs pa’i byang chub tu ‘gro bar byed pa (C) *abhinnaH saMstUpaH*, mi mthun pa med cing ‘dus pa dang ldan pa zhes bya ba (D) *sapratiZaraNaH*, rten pa yod pa zhes bya ba (E) *ZAstA cAsya tathAgato ‘rhan samyaksambuddhaH*, ‘di ston pa de bzhin gshegs pa dgra bcom pa yang dag par rdzogs pa’i sangs rgyas

The usages of the word *niyyAnika* are listed in the PTSD, 369a and the following seems to be a little similar to this phrase⁸.

SN, V.380:

(A) idha dhammo svAkkhAto hoti supavedito (B) nIyAniko upasamasaMvattaniko (E?) sammAsambuddhapavedito.

VyY, 7 =Mvy, 1303-1307

VyY:

(A) dge slong dag nga’i chos ni legs par gsungs pa/ (B) gsal ba/ (C) phye* ba/ (D) rgyu ba bcad pa/ (E) lha dang mi’i bar dag la yang dag par shin tu bstan pa’o

* Lee: tshe em.

Mvy, 1303-1307 (=Mvy(N), 1307-1311):

(A) *svAkhyAto me bhikSavo dharmaH*, dge slong dag nga’i chos ni legs par gsungs pa (B) *uttAnaH*, gsal ba (C) *vivRtaH*, rnam par phye ba (D) *chinnnaplotikaH*, rgyu ba bcad pa (E) *yAvad devamanuSyebhyaH suprakAZitaH*, *lha dang mi’i bar dag la yang dag par shin tu bstan pa*

According to the CPD, I.380a: *uttAna*, this phrase appears in the SN, II.28.20-21 and the MN, I.141.20-21 (*AlagaddUpamasutta*).

MN:

(evaM) (A) svAkkhAto bhikkhave mayA dhammo (B) *uttAno* (C)

⁸ Cf. DN, III.120, DA, 19 T1.73a. On *saMstUpa*, see BHSD, 543b.

vivaTo (E) pakAsito (*sic.* pakasito) (D) chinnapilotiko

The order of item (D) and (E) in the PAli is different from that of both the Mvy and the VyY. And the item (E) in the PAli is different from that of the VyY and the Mvy. But, what is interesting is that in the Chinese correspondence of the above MN, i. e. MA, 200 the order of item (D) and (E) is the same as the VyY and the Mvy and this *sUtra* has the same word as found in the VyY and the Mvy (E)⁹.

MA, 200 (T1. 766b):

(A)我法善說 (B)發露 (C)廣布 (**vivRtaH*) (D)無有空缺 (**chinnapilotikaH*) (E)流布宣伝乃至天人 (**yAvad devamanuSyebhyaH suprakAZitaH*)

By the way, the heading of the Mvy, chapter LXIII (63) (=Mvy, 1280-1307) is ‘*dharmaपaryAyAH* or synonyms of the teaching’ (Mvy, 1279), but according to the above lists (VyY, 5-7), this chapter is further divided into the following four groups: Mvy, 1280-1290¹⁰; Mvy, 1291-1297; Mvy, 1298-1302; and Mvy, 1303-1307.

VyY, 8 =Mvy, 1119-1123

VyY:

(A) bcom ldan ‘das kyi nyan thos kyi dge ‘dun ni legs par zhugs pa/ (B) rigs par zhugs pa/ (C) drang por zhugs pa/ (D) mthun par zhugs pa/ (E) chos dang rjes su mthun par spyod pa’o.

Mvy, 1119-1123:

(A) *supratipanno bhagavataH ZrAvakasaMghaH*, bcom ldan ‘das kyi nyan thos kyi dge ‘dun ni legs par zhugs pa (B) *nyAyapratipannaH*, rigs par zhugs pa (C) *RjupratipannaH*, drang por zhugs pa (D) *sAmIclpratipannaH*, mthun par zhugs pa (E) *anudharmapraticArI, chos dang rjes su mthun par spyod pa*

This phrase is often found when the SaNgha or the Community is praised (cf. PTSD, *ujupaTipanna* and *JAYa-paTipanna*).

AN, (6.10. *MahAnAma*; cf. VyY, 79) III.286 4-6:

(A) supaTipanno bhagavato sAvakasaGgho, (C) ujupaTipanno bhagavato sAvakasaGgho, (B) JAyapaTipanno bhagavato sAvakasaGgho,

⁹ Chinese correspondence of the above SN, II.28.20-21 (SA, 348) has no such word.

¹⁰ I cannot cite this group here but this is a famous phrase praising dharma or teaching beginning with ‘brahmacaryam Adau kalyANam’. This phrase is found in SN, I.105 etc (CPD, II.57b: AdikalyANa) and in the VyY (*sUtra* 0. Lee, 2.n.5) also.

(D) samIci(/sAmIci)paTipanno bhagavato sAvakasaGgho

The PAli lacks the item (E) and the order of item (B) and (C) is different from that of the VyY and the Mvy (I did not cite here but it is also the case of the other PAli sources of this phrase). Chinese Agama, on the other hand, accords to the VyY and the Mvy.

SA, 931. T2.238a:

(復次聖弟子念於僧事) (A) 世尊弟子善向 (B) 正(*nyAya) 向 (C) 直 (*Rju) 向 (D) 誠向 (E) 行隨順法(*anudharmapraticArI)

VyY, 19= Mvy, 2191-2198

VyY:

(A) chags pa dang/ (B) zhen pa dang/ (C) ‘chums (P ‘chum) pa dang/ (D) mdud pa (P par) bor ba dang/ (E) brgyal ba dang/ (F) lhag par chags pa dang/ (G) lhag par zhen par gyur pa

Mvy, 2191-2198:

(A) *rakta*, (shen pa) chags pa (B) *sakta*, (shums pa ‘am mkhren pa) zhen pa (C) *gRddha*, ‘khren pa (D) *granthika*, mdud pa ‘ong ba (E) *mUrcchita*, brgyal ba (F) *adhyavasista*, (lhag par shen pa) lhag par chags pa (G) *adhyavasAnam Apanna*, lhag par chags par gyur pa

This *sUtra* is also cited in the *UpAyikA* by Zamathadeva (Honjō, 10: Number [23]¹¹) and in his Japanese translation of this passage, Honjō points out that AN, 5.55(III.67-69) has some relation to the passage cited by the *UpAyikA* (on this phrase, see also CPD, I.50b: *ajjhopanna*)¹².

AN, III. 68.13-14 (5.55.):

(A) sattA (B) rattA (C) giddhA (D) gadhitA(/gathitA) (E) mucchitA (F) ajjhopannA

UpAyikA, P Thu 26b8-27a1:

(A) chags pa dang/ (B) zhen pa dang/ (C/D?) chags zhen dang/ (E) brgyal ba dang/ (G) zhen pa thob pa ni...

Item (C) is different between the VyY and the Mvy¹³.

¹¹ Honjō, Yoshifumi (1985) “Agon to Kusyaron-Kaihon (2)-“ (Agama and The Abhidharmakoza: DhAtunirdeza (2)), Nanto Bukkyō, 54, 1-17 (L).

¹² According to the detail of this sUtra cited in the VyYT, this phrase is an adjective used when a man loves a woman’s figure deeply. AA, 9.7-8 (T2.563a-b) also deal with the same theme.

¹³ The item (C) in the VyY (‘chums pa) is according to the Mvy, 5383 (Mvy(N), 5371) niyantri or addiction (cf. BHSD, 298b: niyanti).

VyY, 20 =Mvy, 2198-2201

VyY:

(bram ze ‘dod pa la ‘dod chags dang/) (A) lhag par zhen pa dang/ (B) rnam par bcings pa dang/ (C) yongs su zhen pa dang/ (D) kun tu ‘dod chags (kyi rgyus ...)

Mvy, 2198-2201:

(A) *adhyavasAnam*, lhag par zhen pa (B) *vinibandhaH*, rnam par bcings pa (C) *parigredhaH*, yongs su zhen pa (D) *saMrAgaH*, (kun tu chags pa) kun tu ‘dod chags pa

This *sUtra* is found in the *UpAyikA* by Zamathadeva (Honjō, 9: Number [22]) and Honjō indicates the following *sUtras* as the sources of that part of the *UpAyikA*.

AN, I.65 (2.4.6):

k A m a r A g a (X) v i n i v e s a (B) v i n i b a n d h a (C) p a l i g e d h a (Y)
p a r i y u T T h A n a j h o s A n a h e t u k h o b r A h m a N a ...

SA, 546

答梵志言 貪欲繫著因縁故

UpAyikA:

bram ze ‘dod pa la chags pa dang/ (A) zhen pa dang/ (B) ‘brel pa dang/ (X) mnong par ‘dod pa dang/ (D) yang dag par chags pa’i rgyus ...

The phrase found in the *UpAyikA* is nearest to the one found in the VyY and the Mvy.

What is noticed here is that the wording and the order of the VyY, 19-20 and the Mvy, 2191-2201 show correspondence.

VyY, 23 =Mvy, 5390-5393

VyY:

(A) thags 'khrugs pa lta bu dang/ (B) dru bu 'dzings pa lta bu dang/ (C) rtsva mun dza dang/ bal ba dza lta bur (D) 'ong ba dang 'gro bar gyur cing/

Mvy, 5390-5393:

(A) *tantrajAlajAtaH*, thags ‘khrugs pa lta bu (B) *guDAguJjikabhUtAH*, dru gu ‘dzings pa lta bu (C) *muJjabalbajajAtAH*, rtsva mun dza dang bal ba dza lta bur gyur pa (D) *AjavaMjavasamApannaH*, ‘ong ba dang ‘gro bar gyur ba

As is pointed out by Sakaki (354.n.4), this phrase is found in the AN, II.211¹⁴.

AN:

(A) tantAkulakajAtA (B) guNaguNikajAtA (C) muJjapabbajabhUtA
(X) apAyaM duggatiM vinipAtaM samsAraM nAtivattanti/

VyY, 24 =Mvy, 694

VyY:

(A) sdug bsngal ba/ (B) mi bzad pa/ (C) rtsub pa/ (D) tsha ba/

Mvy, 6694:

(A) *duHkhAM*, sdug bsngal (B) *tIvrAM*, mi zad pa(r) (C) *kharAM*, rtsub pa (D) *kaTukAM*, tsha ba

The source of this phrase is SN, I.27 (1.4.8, Sakalikam) etc (see CPD, III.42b: *kaTuka*)

SN:

(sArIrIkA vedanA) dukkhA tibbA kharA kaTukA asAtA amanApA.

Thus, this item is understood as describing painful feeling (*vedanA*).

VyY, 41 =Mvy, 215-228

VyY, 41 is on *abhijJA* or the supernatural power and corresponds to the above Mvy which are under the heading: *abhijJA-karmANi* or the acts of the supernatural powers (Mvy, 210. from Mvy, 211-234). The source is DN, 3. *AmbaTTasutta* (DA, 13).

VyY, 45 =Mvy, 1508-1509

The heading of the Mvy, chapter LXIX (69) (=Mvy, 1504-1509) is *catvAry apramNAni* or four unlimited (Mvy, 1503) which constitutes *maitrI*, *karuNA*, *muditA*, and *upekSA*. Among them, the VyY, 45 and Mvy, 1508-1509 describe the *maitrI* or sympathy in detail. The sources are DN, 13. *Tevijjasutta* (DA, 16) and DN, 25. *UdumbarikasIhanAdasuttanta* (DA, 8).

VyY, 57 =Mvy, 2913-2920

VyY:

(dMag ldan chos 'di ni) (A) zab pa/ (B) zab par snang ba/ (C) mthong

¹⁴ But, judged from the detail of VyY, 23 cited by GuNamati (VyYT, D174a6-174b1, P41b6-42a1), the Chinese corresponding Agama (AA, T2.256a) seems to correspond well to the VyY.

bar dka' ba/ (D) khong du chud par dka' ba/ (E) brtag mi nus pa/ (F) rtog ge'i spyod yul ma yin pa / (G) zhib mo brtags pa'i mkhas pa dang/ mdzangs pas rig par bya ba

Mvy, 2913-2920:

(A) *gambhIraH*, zab pa (B) *gambhIrAvabhAsaH*, zab par snang ba (C) *durdRzaH*, mthong bar dka' ba (X) *duravabodhaH*, <khong du chud par dka' ba (D) *duranubodhaH*¹⁵, <khong du chud par dka' ba> (E) *atarkyaH*, brtag par mi nus pa (F) *atarkAvacaraH*, rtog ge'i spyod yul ma yin pa (G) *sUkSmaM nipiNapaNDitavijJavedanIyaH*, zhib mor brtags pa'i mkhas pa dang mdzangs pas rig pa

Similar phrase is found in PAli nikAya (cf. CPD, I.76b: *atakkAvacara*).

MN, I.167.30-32:

Adhigato kho me ayaM dhammo (A) gambhIro (C) duddaso (D) duranubodho (X) santo (X') paNIto (F) atakkAvacaro (G) nipiNo paNDitavedanIyo

However, the source of the VyY must be SA, 105 because this *sUtra* referrs to the name ‘*dMag ldan*’ and this seems to correspond to 仙尼 (PAli: Seniya, Skt.: Zrenika; see Akanuma, 611ab) and he is a main character in the SA 105¹⁶ (but the phrase in this *sUtra* is a little different from that found in the VyY. The PAli correspondence (SN, 44.9? see Akanuma, 32), on the other hand, do not have this kind of phrase at all).

SA, 105. T2.32a:

(仙尼) ... 此(A)甚深處 (C) 難見 (D) 難知 應須 甚深照 (G) 微妙至到 聰慧所了

By the way, this phrase is also found in the *SamdhinirmocanasUtra* (SNS) when it describes the MahAyAnasUtra (in this context, *PrajJApAramitAsUtra*).

SNS, 76.1.4-7:

(Mdo sde ‘di dag ni de bzhing shegs pas gsungs pa) (A) zab pa (B) zab par snang ba (Y) stong pa nyid dang ldan pa (C) mthong bar dka' ba (D) rtogs par dka' ba¹⁷ (E) brtag mi nus pa (F) rtog ge'i spyod yul ma yin pa (G) shib mo brtags pa mkhas ‘dzangs pas rig pa.

¹⁵ This word is found in the BHSD, 266b.

¹⁶ GuNamati's VyYT cites the detail of this sUtra which corresponds to this SA, 105.

¹⁷ Although Lamotte supposes the original Sanskrit of this word as *durvigAhya* (SNS, 76.n.22), *duranubodha* may be plausible.

The SNS seems to have been based on the above canonical phrase and have added the word (Y) stong pa nyid dang ldan pa, *zUnyatApratisaMyukta¹⁸ which is an important teaching both for the *PrajJApAramitAsUtra* and for this very *sUtra*.

VyY, 66 =Mvy, 7016-7023

VyY:

(chos mngon pa (*abhidharma) dang ‘dul ba mngon pa (*abhivinaya) las ‘dri ba ‘dris pa yang shes shing/) (A) tshig dang yig ‘bru rigs pa dang/ (B) ‘brel pa dang/ (C) rjes su mthun pa dang/ (D) ‘byor ba dang/ (E) thabs dang ldn pa dang/ (F) ‘tsham pa dang/ (G) mthun pa dang/ (H) rtag ‘grus skyong gi yan lag gi tshogs rnams kyis lan lgon par byed do

Mvy, 7016-7023

(A) yuktaiH padavyaJjanaiH (B) sahitaiH (C) AnulomikaiH (D) AnucchavikaiH (E) aupaiH (F) pratirUpaiH (G) pradakSiNaiH (H) nipakasyAGgasaMbhAraiH

I cannot find the source of this phrase but in the following *sUta*, the words *abhidharma* and *abhivinaya* appear (CPD, I.350b: *abhidhamma*).

AN, 3.138. *Assasadassa* (I.290.17-18):

abhidhamme kho pana abhivinaye paJhaM puTTho vissajjeti no saMsAdeti.

But Chinese correspondence seems to be similar to the phrase found in the VyY.

SA, 918 (T2.233a)(cf. SA, 917):

(若有問阿毘曇律) 能以 次第 句味(*padavyaJjana) 隨順 (*anulomika) 決定 而爲解說 (是名色具足)

By the way, this phrase is found in the YogAcAra literatures several times. ZBh, 222.15-16¹⁹:

(kathAm kathayati ...) (A) yuktaiH padavyaJjanaiH (B) sahitair (C) AnulomikaiH (D) AnucchavikaiH (E) aupAyikaiH (F) pratirUpaiH (G) pradakSiNair (H) nipakasyAGgasaMbhAraiH

BBh, 145.21-24:

¹⁸ Lamotte supposes as zUnyatAsaMprayukta (SNS, 76.n.20).

¹⁹ ZrAvakabhUmi Revised Sanskrit Text and Japanese Translation The First Chapter, ZrAvakabhUmi Study Group, Taisho University, The Sankibo Press, Tokyo: 1998.

dharmaM dezayati (em. dezavati) (A) yuktaiH padavyaJjanaiH (B) sahitair (C) Anulomikair (D) Anucchavikair (E) aupayikaiH (F) pratirUpaiH (G) pradakSiNair (H) nipakasyAGgasaMbhAraiH

MSABh, 79.4-12 (Chap. 12)²⁰

vyaJjanasaMpattau zlokadvayam/
uddezAn nirdezAt tathaiva yAnAnulomanAt zlAkSNyAt/
pratItiyAd yAthArhAn nairyANyAd AnukUlyatvAt//8//

(A) yuktaiH padavyaJjanaiH uddezAt pramANAvirodhena/ (B) sahitair nirdezAd uddezAvirodhena/ yAnAnulomanAd (C) Anulomikair yAnatrayAvirodhena/ zlAkSNyAd (D) anucchavikair akaSTazabdatayA/ prAtItiyAd (E) aupayikaiH pratItArthatayA cArthopagamanAt/ yAthArhAt (F) pratirUpair vineyAnurUpatayA/ nairyANyAt (G) pradakSiNair nirvANAdhikAratayA/ AnukUlyAn (H) nipakasyAGgasaMbhAraiH zaikSasyAryASTAGgamArgAnukUlAt/

MSABh, 1 (Chap. 1)

(amalaiH padair iti) (A) yuktaiH (B) sahitair iti vistaraH/

It is not noticed before but as Vasubandhu cites this phrase as a *sUtrakhaNDa*, the same phrase which appears in these texts also seems to be a canonical phrase.

VyY, 67 =Mvy, 7024, 7026

VyY:

(A) lha cang smra bar yang mi bya zhing ... (B) ‘phags pa rnams ni de ltar brjod cing ‘phags pa rnams kyi brjod pa ni de lta bu yin no

Mvy:

Mvy, 7024: (A) *nAtijalpayet*, (lha cang smra ba mang du mi bya/) lha cang smra ba yang mi bya

Mvy, 7026²¹: (B) *evam AryAnAM mantraNA*, de ltar ‘phags pa rnams kyis smra ba (‘am ‘gro ba ‘am brjod pa)

Only the item (B) is found in the AN.

AN, I.199.14 (3.67. *KathAvattu*)

²⁰ MSABh: MahAyAnasUtrAlaMkArabhASya. MahAyAnasUtrAlaMkAra-Exposé de la Doctrine du Grand Vehicle selon le Système YogAcAra-, Tome 1; Texte, Lévi, Sylvain ed., Paris, 1907.

²¹ The middle item of the above is Mvy, 7025: nAtisaret (not go too far).

evaM kho ariyA mantenti esA ariyAna mantanA²²

VyY, 69 =Mvy, 7027

VyY:

log par lta ba spang du rung ba

Mvy, 7027:

labhyA mithyAdRSTiH prahAtum, log par lta ba (spong bar nus pa ‘am)
spong bar rung ba

SA, 770²³:

邪見可斷

VyY, 70 =Mvy, 7028-7029

VyY:

(A) gang zag gis gang zag la tshod ma bzung shig (B) gang zag la tshad
ma ‘dzin cig

Mvy, 7028-7029:

(A) *mA pudgalaH pudgalaM pramiNotu*, gang zag gis gang zag la tshod
ma bzung shig

(B) *pudgale vA mA pramANam udgRhNAtu*, gang zag la tshad kyang
ma ‘dzin cig

This phrase is found when the Buddha teaches that the *bhikSus* should not take the measure of persons and that it is only the Buddha who could take the measure of persons²⁴.

AN, X.75. *MigasAlA* (SA, 990. T.2.258a):

(A) mA puggalesu pamANikA ahuvattha (B) mA puggalesu pamANaM
gaNhittha

As is seen from above lists, the VyY, 66-70 and the Mvy, 7016-7029 correspond well although they are taken from the various *sUtras*. Thus, it is probable that the above Mvy have taken its vocabularies from the VyY.

VyY, 73 =Mvy, 8708-8712

VyY:

²² Cf. MA, 120. T1, 609b: 是聖說義 是聖說事.

²³ The PAli correspondence (SN, 45.21. Micchattam) has no such phrase.

²⁴ See F.L. Woodward’s translation (The Book of the Gradual sayings, V. 97. PTS)

(dge sbyong du byed pa'i chos bzhi ni) (A) gshe yang slar mi gshe/ (B) khros kyang slar mi khro// (C) brtegs kyang slar mi brteg// (D) mtshang brus kyang slar mtshang mi 'bru'o

Mvy, 8709-8712:

(A) *AkruSTena na pratyAkroSTavyam*, gshe yang slar mi gshe bar bya/ gshe yang slar mi gshe (B) *roSitenā na pratiroSitavyam*, khros kyang slar mi khro bar bya (D) *bhaNDitena na pratibhaNDitavyam*, mtshang (/ 'tshang) 'brus kyang slar mtshang (/ 'tshang) mi 'bru bar bya (C) *tADitena na pratitADitavyam*, brdeg kyang slar brdeg par mi bya

According to Mvy, 8708, the above items are on 'catvAraH zramaNa kAraka dharmAH' or 'the four elements which zrAmaNa [should] do'. In the PAli NikAya, there is a *sUtra* named *Akkosa* (SN. I. 162 (7.1.2)) and the Chinese correspondence seems to be the source of this phrase (The PAli NikAya do not have the identical phrase).

SA, 1152 (T2.307a):

(A) 罷不報罵 (B) 瞞不報瞋 (C) 打不報打 (D) 鬪不報鬪

The order of the third and fourth item in the VyY is different from that in the Mvy and agrees with the Chinese Agama.

VyY, 74 =Mvy, 1619, 1621-1627

VyY:

(tshul khrims 'di dag ni) (A) ma nyams pa (B) skyon med pa/ (C) 'dren mar ma gyur pa/ (D) thun tshags ma yin pa/ (E) rang dbang can/ (F) nog nog por ma gyur pa/ (G) legs par chub pa/ (H) legs par brtsams pa/ (X) mkhas pa rnams kyis bsngags pa/ (Y) mkhas pa rnams kyis ma smad pa yin no

Mvy, 1619, 1621-1627²⁵:

(A) Mvy, 1621: *akhaNDam*, ma nyams pa (B) Mvy, 1619: *acchidram*, skyon med pa (C) Mvy, 1622: *azavalam*, 'dren mar* ma 'gyur pa (D) Mvy, 1623: *akalmASam*, thun tshags ma yin pa, (E) Mvy, 1624: *bhujiSyaM*, rang dbang can (F) Mvy, 1625: *aparAmRSTam*, nog nog por ma gyur pa (G) Mvy, 1626: *susamApta*, (legs par 'dzin pa'am) legs par chub pa (H) Mvy, 1627: *susamArabdhā*, legs par brtsams pa

* Mvy (N), 1628: <'dres/ 'gres/ 'grel> <par/ mar>

²⁵ The order of the VyY and the Mvy slightly differs and in the sequence of the Mvy, 1619-1627, only Mvy 1620 (yAtitl, stombrtson) drops in the VyY.

On the sources of these phrases, see CPD (I.14a: *akhaNDa*). One of them is:

DN, 16. *MahAparinibbAnasuttanta* (II.80.23-25):

(yAni tAni zIlAni) (A) akhaNDAni (B) acchiddAni (C) asabalAni (D) akammAsAni (E) bhujissAni (X) viJJUpasatthAni (F) aparAmATThAni (Z) samAdhisamvattanikAni ...

The *MahAparinirvAnasUtra*, on the other hand, includes item (X) and (Y) which are found in the VyY but not found in the Mvy.

MSP, 132 (2.34) (The passage in the DA, T1.12a is a little different):

yAni tAni zIlAni (A) akhaNDAny (B) acchidrAny (C) azabalAny (D) akalmASANi (E) bhujisYAny (F) aparAmRSTAni (G) susamAptAni (H) susamAdattAni (X) vijaprazastAny (Y) agarhitAni vijJais ...

In this *sUtra*, this phrase is found as the fifth item of *SaTsaMraMjanIyA dharmAH* or the six pleasing elements²⁶ and used to qualify the *zillas* or moral habits.

VyY, 77 =Mvy, 7035-7038

VyY:

(A) de ni mig gi rgya mtsho (B) dba' rlabs dang bcas pa (C) klong dang bcas pa (D) 'dzin khri dang bcas pa (X) srin po dang bcas pa las brgal ba yin no

Mvy, 7035-7038:

(A) *atArSIC cakSuH samudram*, des ni mig gi rgya mtsho las brgal ba (B) *sormikam*, dba' rlabs dang bcas pa (C) *sAvartam*, klong dang bcas pa (D) *sagrAham*, 'dzin khri dang bcas pa

As the theme of this *sUtrakhaNDa* (i. e. **samudra*, ocean) shows, this source is SN, 35.187. *Samudda*(SA, 217), IV.157.6-10:

SN:

(cakkhu bhikkhave purisassa samuddo tassa rUpamayo vego// yo taM rUpamayaM vegaM sahati ayaM vuccati bhikkhave)

(A) atari cakkhusamuddaM (B) saUmiM (saummiM) (C) sAvaTTaM (D) sagAhaM (X) sarakkhasaM tiNNo (pAragato thale tiTThati brAhmaNo)//

²⁶ In the DN, this *saMraMjanIyA* is *aparihAniya* or unfailing. In the AN, this phrase is the fourth item of *cha sArANIyA dhammA* or the six things to be remembered.

The meaning of the above Mvy becomes clear by consulting its source. This *sUtra* compares the eye (**cakSus*)²⁷ to the ocean (**samudra*) and this phrase describes a person who endured the object-made impulse.

VyY, 78 =Mvy, 1102-1111

VyY:

(A) shes rab myur ba (B) shes rab mgyogs pa ((C) shes rab rno ba/ (D) nges par ‘byung ba’i shes rab can/ (E) nges par ‘byed pa’i shes rab can/ (F) shes rab che ba/ (G) shes rab yangs pa/ (H) shes rabzab pa/ (I) shes rab mnyam pa med pa/ (J) shes rab rin po che dang ldn pa

Mvy, 1102-1111:

(A) *Azu-prajJaH*, shes rab myur ba (B) *javana-prajJaH*, shes rab ‘gyogs pa (C) *tIkSuNa-prajJaH*, shes rab rno ba (D) *niHsaraNa-prajJaH*, nges par ‘byung ba’i shes rab can (E) *nairvadhika-prajJaH*, nges par ‘byed pa’i shes rab can (F) *mahA-prajJaH*, shes rab che ba (G) *pRthu-prajJaH*, shes rab yangs pa (H) *gambhIra-prajJaH*, zab pa’i shes rab (I) *asama-prajJaH*, shes rab mnyam pa med pa (J) *prajJA-ratna-samanvAgataH*, shes rab rin po che dang ldn pa

As the heading of this chapter of the Mvy (Chap. XLVIII (48)=Mvy, 1075-1126): *ZrAvaka-guNAH*: nyan thos kyi yon tan gyi ming la or “on the names of the virtue[s] of the disciple” (Mvy, 1074) shows, these items refer to the virtues of the famous disciple ZAriputra and very often found when ZAriputra is praised of his wisdom in the Agama or NikAya (MN, 111. *Anupadasutta*. III.25; MA, 27 etc.)

VyY, 79 =Mvy, 2844-48

VyY:

(‘di la ‘phags pa nyan thos thos pa dang ldn pa ni bdag ni skye dgu ser sna’i dri mas kun nas dkris pa rnams las sems dri ma’i ser sna dang bral bas)

(A) lhug par gtong ba dang (B) lag brkyang ba dang (C) rnam par gtong ba la dga’ ba dang/ (D) sbiyin pa la rgyun mi ‘chad pa dang/ (gtong ba phun sum tshogs pa dang/) (E) sbiyin pa la ‘ged par dga’ bas ...

Mvy, 2844-2848:

²⁷In the Pali, the tongue and the mind are also compared to the ocean and their objects are compared to the impulses (vegas). In the Chinese Agama, on the other hand, six senses are compared to the ocean and their objects to the impulses.

(A) *mukatyAgaH*, lhug par gtong ba (B) *pratatapANiH*, lag pa brkyang ba (C) *vyavasargarataH*, rnam par gtong ba la dga' ba (D) *yAyajUkaH*, sbyin pa mi chad par byed pa (E) *dAnasaMvibhAgarataH*, sbyin pa la 'gyed par dga' ba

AN, 6.10.*MahAnAma* (III.287.4-8):

(puna ca paraM mahAnAma) ariyasAvako attano cAgaM anussarati lAbhA vata me suladdhaM vata me yo 'haM maccheramalapariyuTThitAya pajAya vigatamalamaccherena cetasA agAraM ajjhAvasAmi (A) muttacAgo (B) payatapANi (C) vossaggarato (D) yAcayogo (E) dAnasaMvibhAgarato ti.

According to the PTSD (552a: *yAca*), the word *yAca* is “Freq in ster. phrase mutta-cAga ...” and is found in the AN, I 226 etc. However, the source of the VyY *sUtra* 79 must be the above AN. The reason is that the subject of the VyY *sUtras* 78 to 81 is on the virtues of the Buddha's pupils and it is only the above AN that connects this phrase to the Buddha's pupil (in this case MahAnAma).

VyY, 82 =Mvy, 7040, 7039, 6284

VyY:

(dge slong dag rGyal po Legs mthong chen po ni ... gang gis na de) (A) zos pa dang 'thungs pa dang/ 'chos pa dang/ myangs pa rnams legs par bde bar 'ju ste/ (B) pho ba'i drod* snyoms shing 'ju bar byed pa dang ldan pas (C) gnod ba nyul ba dang/ (D) nad med pa'i rang bzhin can du gyur to

* Lee drong em.

Mvy:

(A) Mvy, 7040: *azitapItakhAditAsvAditAni samyak sukhena paripAkAM gacchanti*, zos pa dang 'thungs pa dang 'chos pa dang myangs pa rnams legs par bde bar 'ju (B) Mvy, 7039: *samayA pAcanyA grahanNyA samanvAgataH*, pho ba'i drod snyoms shing 'ju bar byed pa dang ldan pa (C) Mvy, 6284: *alpAbAdhatA*, gnod pa nyung (chung)

These phrases refer to the virtue of the *rGyal po Legs mthong chen po* or the King MahAsudassana (MahAsudarzana) and corresponds to DN, 17 or rather the *MahAparinirbANasUtra* because, although according to the CPD (I.317ba: *appAbAdha*) not a few *sUtras* include these phrases, only that *sUtra* refers to that king.

DN, 17, *MahAsudassanasuttanta* (II. 177.28):

puna ca paraM Ananda rAjA MahAsudassano (C) appAbAdho ahosi (X) appAtaGko (B) samavepAkiniyA gahaNiyA samannAgato ...

MPS, 314 (34.23):

punar aparaM rAjA MahAsudarzano (C) ‘lpAbAdho ‘bhUd (D) arogajAtIyaH (B) samavipacanayA grahaNyA samanvAgato ... (A) yayAsyAzitapItakhAditasvAditaM samyak sukhena paripAkaM gatam abhUt/

This passage describes the third *Rddhi* or prosperity which the king MahAsudassana possesses.

VyY, 83 =Mvy, 2431-2433

VyY, Lee, 134.1-2 (D74a2-5):

(A) ci ‘dod pa bzhin thob pa (B) tshegs* med par thob pa (C) ngan ngon ma yin par thob pa

*Lee: tshogs em.

Mvy, 2431-2433

(A) *nikAmalAbhI*, ‘dod pa bzhin thob pa (B) *akRcchralAbhI*, dka’ pa med par thob pa (C) *akisaralAbhI*, (tshegs pa med par thob pa ‘am) ngan ngon ma yin par thob pa

These are the phrases which are used in describing the *catur-jJAna* or the ‘four meditation’²⁸.

AN, IV.230.21-23 (MA, 74, T1.541a):

(imesaJ ca catunnaM jhAnAnaM abhicetasikAnaM diTThadhammasukhavihArAnaM)

(A) *nikAmalAbhI* bhavissasi (B) *akicchalAbhI* (C) *akasiralAbhI*

VyY, 97 =Mvy, 2435-2439

VyY:

(A) ston pa’i bstan pa bzhin byed pa/ (B) mi gtong bar sgom pa/ (X) lhag mthong dang ldan pa/ (C) khyim stong pa rnams rgyas par byed pa dang/ (D) rang gi don gyi sbyor ba la rjes su brtson pa/ (X’) tshangs pa mtshungs par spyod pa (X’’) mkhas pa rnams kyis ma smad pa/ (E) yul ‘khor gyi bsod snyoms ‘bras bu yod par za ba

Mvy, 2435-2439:

²⁸ See BHSD. This refers to the BBh (388.13: *nikAmalAbhitA akRcchrAkisaralAbhitA*) etc.

(A) *zAstuH zAsanakaraH*, ston pa'i bstan pa spyod pa (bstan pa spyod pa) (B) *anirAkRto dhyAyI*, mi gtong bar bsgom pa (C) *v(/b) RMhayitA²⁹* *zUnyAgArANAm*, khyin stong pa rgyas par byed pa (D) *svakArthayogam anuyuktaH*, rang gi don sbyor ba la rjes su brtson pa (E) *amogharASTrapiNDam paribhuGkte*, yul 'khor gyi bsod snyoms don yod par yongs su za ba

According to the CPD, I.399a: *amogha* and ibid., 424b: *aritta-jjhAno*, this phrase is found in the AN, I.10.22 and AN, I.38 (and further, AN, I.43).

AN, I.11.3-4:

(B) *arittajjhAno viharati* (A) *satthu sAsanakaro (X'')* ovAdapatikaro
(E) *amoghaM raTThapiNDaM bhuJjati³⁰*

Judged by the AN, this phrase is used to qualify a *bhikkhu* or monk who cultivated a *mettAcitta* or thought of sympathy.

VyY, 98 =Mvy, 2442-2443

VyY:

(A) mi rigs par chags pas (P om. pas) zil gyis non pa dang/ (B) chos log (P logs) pas dkris pa yin no

Mvy, 2442-2443 (=Mvy (N), 2453-2454):

(A) *viSama lobhaH*, mi rigs par chags pa (B) *mithyA dharma parItaH*, chos log pas dkris pa

On this phrase, see CPD, I.126b: *adhammarAga³¹*.

AN, 3.56.*MahAsala*, I.160.3-4(11-12, 21-22):

(etrahi brAhmaNa manussA adhammarAga³¹) (A)
visamalobhAbhibhUtA (B) micchAdhammaparetA

But judged from the words in front and behind (not cited here) of the VyY, the above may be not the source of this part of the VyY.

3. Conclusion

In the above comparative inquiry, I pointed out that some of the *sUtrakhaNDas* in the VyY Chap. 2 or rather *VyAkhyAyukti-sUtrakhaNDazata* are found in the Mvy(VyY, 5;7, 19;20, 66;70, (97;98 ?). At the same time, by

²⁹ On bRMhayitA / vRMhayitA, see BHSD, 401b: bRMha (one who magnifies, exalts)

³⁰ Not only item (X'') in the AN does not correspond neither the VyY nor Mvy, but also items (X), (X'), and (X'') in the VyY have no corresponding items in the Mvy and the AN. It is often the case that Agamas cited by the VyY correspond well to Chinese Agama rather than the PAli NikAya, however, the above PAli texts have no Chinese correspondence (see Akanuma).

³¹Cf. BBh, 253.1: adharmarAgAZ ca viSamalobhAZ.

tracing some sources of the phrases in the Mvy, I clarified the contexts of these phrases which are cited in the Mvy only fragmentally. This indication about the relationship between the VyY and the Mvy in this section has the following two meaning: one is that we can assume reliable Sanskrit words in the VyY which as a whole is preserved only in the Tibetan translation. The other is that the sources and context of some phrases in the Mvy are made clear. I hope that our future study of this kind will elucidate the compilation of the Mvy and make the Mvy, a great Tibetan glossary, more useful³².

Appendix

1. YaZomittra's *AbhidharmakozavyAkhyA* (AKVy) and the VyY³³

It is well known that Yazomittra's AKVy cites a phrase in Chap. 1 of the VyY in interpreting the case taken by the verb *namas-kR*³⁴. Here, I shall point out that the AKVy also cites VyY's explanation about "threefold revolution and of twelve aspects" (三転十二形相) of the Four Noble Truth (*Aryasatya). Vasubandhu briefly glosses this topic in the AKBh Chap. 6. Yazomittra's AKVy, on the other hand, interprets this topic from four different aspects and this corresponds well to the interpretation found in the VyY Chap. 2.

AKBh, 371.11-13 (ad. *AbhidharmakozakArikA*, VI-54):

kathaM tat triparivartaM dvAdaZAkAraM ca/ idaM duHkham Arya satyam/ tat khalu parijJeyaM tat khalu parijJAtam ity ete trayaH parivartAH/ ekaikaZmiMZ ca parivarte cakuSur udapAdi jJAnaM vidyA buddhir udapAdi ity ete dvAdaZAkArAH/ AKVy, 580-581:

(A) tatrapratyakSArthatvAdanAsravAprajJAcaKSuH/niHsaMZayatvAj jJAnaM/ bhUtArthatvAt vidyA/ viZuddhatvAd buddhiH/ viZuddhA dhIr budhir iti nirukteH/

(B) punar bAhyakAnAM satyeSu darZanaM kudRSTivicikitsAvidyAnAm apratipakSaH sAsravaM ceti tato viZeSaNArthaM cakSurAdigrahaNaM

(C) punas triSu parivarteSu prathamaM darZanaM cakSuH/ yathAdRSTavyavacAraNaM jJAnaM/ yathAvadbhAvikatAm upAdAya buddhiH/ yathAbhUtArthAvabodhAt/

³² Wogiwara's edition of the Mvy contains information about the sources of the Mvy (many of them are Chinese sources). The Sanskrit-Chinese Dictionary of Buddhist Technical Terms Based on the MahAvyutpatti, Unrai Wogiwara, Sankibo Tokyo: 1959.

³³ AKBh: Vasubandhu, AbhidharmakoZabhASya. P.Pradhan ed., Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series 8, Patna, 1967; AKVy: YaZomittra, SphuTArthA AbhidharmakoZavyAkhyA by YaZomittra. Wogiwara, U.ed.,Tokyo, 1932-1936; repr. Tokyo: Sankibo Press, 1971.

³⁴ AKVy, 6.20-21; Lee, 1 (VyY, D29a3).

(D) punar ananuZruteSu dharmeSv AnumAnikajJAnapratiseSdhArthaM cakSur ity Aha/ AdhimokSajJAnapratiseSdhArthaM jJAnam iti/ AbhimAnikajJAnapratiseSdhArthaM vidyeti/ sAsravapratiseSdhArthaM buddhir iti/ VyY, 47 (Lee, 84-85, P66b7-67a7, D57b2-58a1):

tshul bzhin yid la byed pa na mig skyes shing
zhes bya ba ni mdo sde'i dum bu'o//

(A) de la don mngon du gyur pa'i phyir zag pa med pa'i shes rab ni mig go// the tshom med pa'i phyir shes pa'o// yang dag pa mngon du gyur pa'i phyir rig pa'o// rnam par dag pa'i phyir blo ste/ nges pa'i tshig gi chos nyid kyi rgyus na rnam par dag pa'i phyir blo yin no// mig la gzhan pa dang/ nor pa dang/ rnyog pa nyid med par yang dag
par bstan pa'i phyir rnam pa gsum gyi khyad par du byed pa yin no//

(B) gzhan yang phyi rol pa rnams kyi lta ba ni bden pa rnams la ngan par lta ba dang/ the tshom dang/ ma rig pa rnams kyi gnyen po ma yin pa dang zag pa dang bcas pa yin pas de las khyad par du bya ba'i phyir mig la sogs pa smos so//

(C) gzhan yang bzlas pa gsum dag la thog mar mthong ba ni mig go// ji ltar mthong ba la rnam par dpyod pa ni shes pa'o// gnyis po de nyid ji snyed yod pa can nyid la brten nas rig pa ste/ ji snyed yod pa la 'dzin pa'i phyir ro// ji ltar yod pa can nyid la brten nas blo ste/ yang dag pa ji lta ba bzhin du rtogs pa'i phyir ro//

(D) gzhan yang chos ma thos pa rnams la rjes su dpag pa dgag pa'i phyir mig ces bya ba gsungs so// mos pa las byung ba'i mthong ba dgag pa'i phyir shes pa'// mngon pa'i nga rgyal dgag pa'i phyir rig pa'o// zag pa dang bcas pa nyid dgag pa'i phyir blo ste/ rnam par dag pa'i don gis so//

(X) kha cig na re bzod pa ni mthong ba nyid yin pa'i phyir mig yin la/ shes pa ni shes pa nyid yin no zhes zer te/ de ni bzlas pa gsum dag la 'thad pa ma yin te/ de dag ni mthong ba dang/ bsgom pa dang/ mi slob pa'i lam gyis (D58a) bsdus pa'i phyir ro//

Only the underlined part and the last interpretation (X) are not found in the AKVy. However, (A) to (D) in the VyY and the AKVy show a high degree of correspondence as if the latter is a Tibetan translation of the former.

2. GuNaprabha's *BodhisattvabhUmivRtti*

In my previous article³⁵, I reported that some passages found in SAgaramegha's *BodhisattvabhUmivyAkhyA* (D No.4047, P No.5548) are cited from the VyY (from Chap. 3 and Chap. 4). Here, I shall point out that GuNaprabha's *BodhisattvabhUmivRtti* (BBhVR) also cites the VyY (from Chap. 2) at least in the the following three parts. I just point out their locations.

2.1. The second verse found in the beginning of the BBhVR (D141a2-3) seems to be based on the verse in the VyY Chap. 1 (Lee, 7.5-8).

2.2. VyY, (Chap. 2, *sUtra*) 36 is a *sUtrakhaNDa* on *tArkika* or logician. Although I cannot find a corresponding passage in the Agama or NikAya, the very same passages are found in the *BodhisattvabhUmi* (TattvArtha Chap. BBh, 37.23-24) in the interpretation of *yuktiprasiddhatattva*. And similar interpretation to this *sUtrakhaNDa* by Vasubandhu (Lee, 73-75) is found in the BBhVR (D157a4-157b3)³⁶.

2.3. Vasubandhu glosses the VyY, 66 in detail (Lee, 109-111) and this is cited in the BBhVR entirely (BBhVR, D184a5-185a1).

3. BuddhAnusmRtiTIkA

The *sUtras* which teach to recollect “the three treasures” are the *BuddhAnusmRti*, the *DharmAnusmRti* and the *SaGghAnusmRti* (P No.945-947) and they have respectively commentaries (*vRttis*) attributed to AsaGga³⁷. Among them, the *BuddhAnusmRti-vRtti* (P No.5482, D No.3982) has a sub-commentary called *BuddhAnusmRti-TIkA* attributed to Vasubandhu (P No.5487, D No.3987). This text has long parallel passages to the VyY (Chap.2 *sUtra*, 1).

ABBREVIATIONS

All the PAli texts are based on the PTS (AN: *AGguttara NikAya*. DN: *DIgha NikAya*. MN: *Majjhima NikAya*. SN: *SaMyutta NikAya*)

All the Chinese Agamas are based on the Taishō canon (AA: *AGguttara Agama*. DA, *DIRgha Agama*. MA: *Majjhima Agama*. SA: *Samyutta Agama*)

Akanuma: Chizen Akanuma, *The Comparative Catalogue of Chinese*

³⁵Horiuchi,Toshio (2006) “Lù-lín-fàn-zhi-zǐ 鹿林梵志子 in the Samyuktāgama, No.809 : In relation to the Ri dags zlog gi mdo cited in Vasubandhu's Vyākhyāyukti” (Japanese), Studies in Indian Philosophy and Buddhism, 13, 87-101.

³⁶ Lee, 73.n.490: spyod should be emended to dpyod.

³⁷ A Japanese scholar Hideyuki Goda (合田秀行) studies this text.

Agamas & PAli NikAyas, Yokyo, 1958.

BBh: *BodhisatttvabhUmi*. Wogiwara, U. ed., Tokyo, 1930-36.

BHSD: *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar And Dictionary*. Edgerton, F. New Haren: 1953; repr. Delhi: 1970.

CPD: *A Critical PAli Dictionary*. 3 vols. Copenhagen: 1924-.

D: *The Tibetan TripiTaka, Sde dge edition*.

Lee: Lee, Jong Choel (2001) *The Tibetan Text of the VyAkhyAyukti of Vasubandhu* *Bibliotheca Indologica et Buddhologica* 8, Tokyo: The Sankibo Press.

MPS: *MahAparinirvANasUtra*. Waldschmidt, E. ed., Berlin, 1950.

Mvy: *MahAvyutpatti*. Sakaki, R. ed., Kyoto: 1931.

Mvy(N): *A New Critical Edition of The MahAvyutpatti: Sanskrit-Tibetan-Mongolian Dictionary of Buddhist Terminology*, Yumiko Ishihama and Yoichi Fukuda, The Toyo Bunko, 1989.

P: *The Tibetan TripiTaka, Peking edition*.

PTS: The Pali Text Society.

PTSD: *The Pali Text Society's PAli-English Dictionary*.

SNS: *SaMdhinirmocana-sUtra*. Lamotte, Étienne ed., Paris, 1935, D No.106, P No.774.

T: Taishō canon

VyY: Vasubandhu, *VyAkhyAyukti*. D No.4061, P No.5562. See also Lee.

VyYT: GuNamati, *VyAkhyAyukti-TIkA*. D No.4069, P No.5570.